



# EHISTO

European history crossroads as pathways  
to intercultural and media education

LLP-Comenius-Project  
November 2012 – October 2014

## Baseline study

Workpackage 2, Del. 2.1/2.2/2.3



With the support of the Lifelong Learning Programme (LLP) of the European Union.

Version No.	Author, institution	Date/Last Update
<i>1</i>	<i>Prof. Dr. Terry Haydn, University of East Anglia</i>	<i>15/05/2013</i>

## **Index**

<b>1. A reminder of the overarching aims of the EHISTO Project</b> .....	3
<b>2. The aims and scope of the EHISTO baseline study</b> .....	4
<b>3. Outcomes of the EHISTO baseline study</b> .....	5
3.1. History didactics' views on the use of popular history magazines in history education at the start of the project (Deliverable 2.3).....	5
3.2. History teachers' current views and practice on the use of popular history magazines and the role of critical media literacy in history education (Deliverable 2.1) .....	7
3.3. Summary of history curricula in partner countries in relation to the aims and focus of the EHISTO project (Deliverable 2.1) .....	11
3.4. EHISTO Analytical framework for the work on popular history magazines (Deliverable 2.2) .....	14

## **1. A reminder of the overarching aims of the EHISTO Project**

The rationale for the EHISTO project is to explore how popular history magazines can be used in history teaching in schools, in history teacher education, and in continuing professional development for teachers, in order to develop the critical media literacy of young people. It will foster the development in young people of intercultural and media-critical competence in dealing with commercial representations of history which they will encounter outside the history classroom, focusing in particular on the phenomenon of popular history magazines which have become increasingly popular and available across EU countries.

The project aims to develop study packages and learning objects based on articles from popular magazines, and activities deriving from the study of those magazine articles. An emphasis will be placed on aspects of history which are covered in the history curricula and in popular magazines across the countries involved in the project, which can be said to represent ‘European History Crossroads’, and which will therefore add an element of multi-perspectivity, interculturality and differing national perspectives to the materials and study packages which are developed.

The outcomes will be in the form of:

- Transnational teaching materials and teacher manuals
- A project seminar and module guide for use in teacher development courses
- A course for teachers and associated handbook which will enable the project materials to be used in schools across the EU
- A project website which will facilitate dissemination of the materials and teaching approaches
- Dissemination through papers and articles presented at relevant history education forums, nationally and internationally
- A network of schools and training institutions which will, in conjunction with the project website and dissemination activities, aid sustainability.

One of the success criteria for the project is that it will make a positive contribution to responsible, European citizenship. It also aims at the development of young people who are historically and critically literate in their understanding of the ways in which history is presented in the media.

Some mention should be made of the Council of Europe recommendations for the teaching of history, as these recommendations form the theoretical framework for structuring materials and activities which might be helpful in developing the critical literacy which is one of the key aims of the project. It is important that these principles are kept in mind when working on activities and learning objects related to history magazine articles throughout the project. For the purposes of this study, we have focused on the following aspects of this guidance:

- The past can be approached and represented from different perspectives
- Historical events and personalities can be interpreted in different ways
- It is in the nature of accounts of the past to differ for a range of reasons
- Ideas and views about the past are time-bound and subject to change

- Sometimes there are people and organisations who seek to use representations of the past for their own present day purposes
- Events in the past were often the result of complex rather than simple causes
- Claims about the past need to be based on the scrupulous use of available evidence, and the use of established disciplinary procedures for evaluating that evidence
- Our knowledge and understanding of the past is often limited; claims about the past may have differing degrees of certainty or validity
- The work of historians is usually subject to the critical scrutiny of other historians

## **2. The aims and scope of the EHISTO baseline study**

In terms of deliverables, the baseline study aims to find out teachers' views and practice in terms of the use of history magazines. 'What questions are worth asking?' about popular history magazines, and what sort of materials and activities based around popular history magazines would be helpful in developing the historical, critical and media literacy of young people?

At the opening EHISTO seminar in Augsburg, it was decided to focus on two particular historical topics which were felt to be commonly represented in the history curricula of partner countries (and probably across the EU in general) and which were likely to be also represented in popular history magazines. The two topics chosen were a) the causes/outbreak of World War One, and b) Voyages of Discovery/Colonialism/Empire. These topics could be seen to represent a European 'history crossroads', in the sense that the topics are widely encountered, both in history classrooms and in 'public history' outside the school, through television, the internet, and in newspapers and magazines.

Through a combination of questionnaires and interviews with history teachers in all five of the countries involved, the baseline study aimed to gain insight into the issues described above, and in particular:

- To what extent do history teachers currently make use of popular history magazines in their teaching?
- What are their ideas about how popular history magazines might be used to develop students' critical media literacy and intercultural understanding?
- History teachers' views about the role that critical media literacy ought to play in history education, and if this is considered to be a legitimate and important aim of history education, how this might best be developed through the use of popular history magazines, and how to address the gap between the sort of history taught in schools and the 'public' history which young people encounter outside school.
- What are history teachers' views on how courses of initial teacher education, and the continuing professional development of qualified teachers might be used to improve young people's critical media literacy through the use of history magazines?
- To what extent are the topics chosen at the Augsburg seminar represented in current history curricula and examinations (and in popular history magazines)?
- How important is the development of critical media literacy through school history in the history curriculum specifications in the countries involved in the project (and to what extent do they embrace the Council of Europe recommendations outlined above)? What are history teachers' views on the use of school history to develop students' critical media literacy?

It was also agreed at the Augsburg kick-off meeting that it would be helpful to gain some insight into the views of history didactics about history magazines, at the outset of the project. These initial views can be found in deliverable WP2.3.

### **3. Outcomes of the EHISTO baseline study**

#### **3.1. History didactics' views on the use of popular history magazines in history education at the start of the project (Deliverable 2.3)**

##### **The purpose of 'pulling together' our thoughts on the possible uses of history magazines in history education**

Although a key part of the baseline project is to ascertain the views of *practising history teachers* about the current and possible uses of history magazines, as interested parties, we are not without our own ideas about these issues, and it might be helpful to 'pull together' these ideas so that they are shared by all the participants in the project, and so they might helpfully inform activities and the design of materials for the project. These points might also form a useful list for comparison at the end of the project, to see which of the ideas have been realised, and to what extent, and to see if people's views have changed over the course of the project (and to see if new points emerge which were not evident at this point).

The following list of points is a summary of the nine responses which were received.

##### **a) Some of the reasons why respondents thought that it would be 'a good thing' if popular history magazines were more extensively used in history education:**

- Magazine articles often provide more depth of historical knowledge/information than text books
- If it led to more students buying history magazines of their own accord, that would be a good thing – signifies a commitment to and engagement with history
- On the whole, history magazines are a fairly 'respectable', trustworthy and to at least some extent scholarly representation of the past compared to some of the history found in newspapers and on the internet
- It can get students 'doing history' outside the confines of school and lessons if they are reading magazine articles in their own time – potentially increases the time that they are engaged with the past
- If they read more than one article on a historical topic, or articles which talk about different opinions about a topic or person, it introduces them to controversies of interpretation and the idea of multiperspectivity
- Similarly, if they read a range of articles on a particular topic they are introduced to the idea of history as something that is mediated by a community of practice which collectively gives authority to findings about the past, and to the idea that history is contested and not subject to a single and simple 'right answer'
- History magazines contribute to good history teaching even if it is just at the level of history teachers and history teacher trainers updating their subject knowledge and keeping up to date with recent scholarship

- Even if students just read history magazines (without necessarily engaging with activities, learning objects, worksheets etc), this is in itself a good thing as it develops their subject knowledge, and offers them good models of academic writing
- High level production values, ‘glossiness’ and topicality and help make history attractive and more connected to the outside world compared to text books

**b) Ideas about the ways in which popular history magazines might be used to improve history education, particularly in respect of EHISTO objectives and Council of Europe guidance on good practice in history education:**

- Many magazines have online features – associated website, podcasts, blogs: it might be good to get students using these features, especially blogs where students can post comments on articles and become actively engaged in debates and controversies about magazine articles.
- As discussed at the kick-off seminar and in the interviews conducted as part of Work Package 2, popular history magazines have some flaws and weaknesses. This is an opportunity rather than a problem. As one respondent pointed out, ‘Pupils can get familiar with quality standards’ (in historical sources) only if they deal with products which often neglect these standards.’
- Issues such as nationalistic bias or the furthering of particular nationalist (or classist, or sexist) agendas can themselves be, or become, the subject of scrutiny in classrooms.’
- Articles can be found which explicitly link past events to current problems and controversies so that students stop thinking of history as something that is past and gone and not very important.
- Find some ‘polemical’ articles that make simple polarisations and which oversimplify historical problems and issues and then find other articles which make students realise that such polarisations and oversimplifications are often unhelpful.
- Useful to find articles which show students how history is often misused by people in the present for unethical purposes (‘I hope students can see the different ways history is popularized (used and misused)’).
- Draw attention to the gap between school history, public history, and ‘popular history magazine history’. Broaden students’ understanding of the breadth of history that is ‘out there’. (‘Examining history magazines, pupils may recognize what kind of history is regarded to be important, they will notice that history in their schoolbooks is not equal to the history presented in magazines.’ ‘There will be differences that students can also identify in classrooms – national perspectives primarily, but perhaps (hopefully) also gender, social and cultural.’
- Develop their understanding of history magazines as cultural artefacts, increase their understanding of ‘signifiers’. (‘I think there is a need to work with meta-questions about teaching and learning from texts, before we actually get into the historical magazines themselves’, ‘It will let students being aware of ideological foundations and commercial interests behind publishing groups. This should be useful for stimulating critical thinking with regard to History and respective narratives, taking into account both ideological differences and uses of information and historical events for political and commercial purposes’).
- Opportunity to develop students’ understanding of the importance of provenance and referencing (‘popular magazines often do not cite the sources’).
- Opportunity to develop students’ understanding of the tentative, provisional and changing nature of historical knowledge (to what extent do magazines acknowledge doubt and uncertainty about conclusions and findings, or present alternative possibilities?)

- Discuss and develop understanding of the changing ‘alphabet –icon ratio’ of contemporary society – use of pictures – as sources, or mainly ‘decorative’ and ‘glossy’?
- Explore possibilities of use in language teaching (‘An obvious possibility for an interdisciplinary teaching combining History and German.’)
- Compare the pros and cons of different history magazines, are some magazines better than others? What makes a history magazine good or bad? Does it depend on ‘audience’?
- Give students practice in critiquing magazine articles for quality and reliability, and get them to think/discuss the comparative reliability of magazine articles in relation to other public sources about history – history in the newspapers, in films, on television, on the internet.
- Important not to lose sight of the motivational potential of history magazines (‘And last not least history magazines can motivate or deepen the interest in history – and this is the most important starting point for acquiring competencies in dealing with historical culture that is around the pupils everywhere.’)

### **3.2. History teachers’ current views and practice on the use of popular history magazines and the role of critical media literacy in history education (Deliverable 2.1)**

**Description:** The result is a collection of documents which report the outcomes of questionnaire and interview surveys of history teachers involved in the EHISTO project in relation to the questions posed above.

#### **A summary of the key findings arising out of the interviews**

##### ***How much are history magazines used?***

Given that there were only 10 interviews, it is important not to place too much emphasis on the responses to this question, but the results seemed to confirm the outcomes of the larger sample from the questionnaire survey: there are some teachers who make substantial use of history magazines in their teaching, but probably a larger number who make only occasional use of them, and some who don’t use them at all. Use varies even *within* history departments.

##### ***Disadvantages of, and reasons for not making more use of history magazines***

- Some of them are not serious and scholarly enough for older pupils taking examinations (‘Some are little more than infotainment.’) For example, *BBC History Magazine* was viewed as much ‘lighter’ than *History Today*, and was therefore much more suitable for use with younger pupils, but not as useful for 16-18 year olds
- However a more common reservation was that the articles were too long and couched in too difficult language for many pupils. There was a worry also that using such dense material indiscriminately might actually put pupils off history.



- Magazine contents often were unbalanced and left important aspects of history out because they were not ‘commercial enough – ‘Too much on kings and wars’, ‘Too much on Henry VIII and Hitler’, not enough on social history and the role of women in history.
- Expense – most schools/departments could not afford to subscribe to history magazines, although some teachers paid for them themselves. It was thought that few pupils had both the desire and the money to buy them for their own personal use given that it was easy to get things on the internet that were free.
- Internet also seen as more convenient, in terms of searching, access and facility to ‘cut and paste.’
- Magazines often didn’t ‘mesh’ with syllabuses, and the fact that for many of them, there is no index provided, meant that it could take ages to find exactly what you wanted. It was not therefore a time effective way of getting hold of things.
- Whole articles were too long and dense for many pupils and therefore needed editing/adapting.... This took a lot of teacher time and was off-putting.
- Just no time to fit them in as using them slowed down content coverage, and teachers felt they had to ‘cover the syllabus’ as a priority.
- Feedback from two of the countries involved in the project made the point that popular history magazines were written primarily for adult readers, or even for ‘a middle class adult’, which meant that teacher mediation was often necessary. Students’ lack of intellectual maturity meant that pupils were often ‘unable to perceive the ideological motivations’ influencing magazine articles.

(It is clear from this list that EHISTO could help to circumvent some of these problems by selecting, adapting and indexing particular articles, in order to save teachers’ time, and provide a sort of ‘Best of history magazines, selecting articles and magazines which were particularly relevant to the development of students’ critical-media literacy and the Council of Europe guidelines).

### ***In what ways are history teachers already using history magazines?***

- Teachers read them just do develop their subject knowledge – don’t necessarily have to be used directly with/by pupils (‘Helps keep me up to date with things – not just new history book reviews, but courses, internet sites, history on TV...’)
- Where pupils are bright enough and committed enough to read magazine articles, this is in itself a really good thing – you don’t always have to have accompanying activities. It would be a good thing if the project just got more students reading history magazines.
- Particularly good for maps and graphics (‘Some beautiful material, very attractive, much more appealing than text books’).
- Good practice often seen in terms of teachers judiciously selecting ‘bits’ from articles, just one picture, or a particularly good bit of prose, rather than risking giving them the whole article to read/work with (‘You also lose a lot of time when you read the whole article.’)
- Really helpful for getting students to understand that ‘everything has a history’ – it’s not just about political and constitutional things, wars etc (‘To fill in gaps – North African history, for example’, ‘Reading for instance about the history of football, or the history of chocolate, which are two articles that I have used, can be a very good way to learn history in an alternative way’)
- In most countries, teachers used magazine articles as a form of differentiation, or ‘extension’ work for able and/or committed students ‘For the circle of students interested in history – to prepare them for competitions or just to encourage them to sustain their interest in history’

- Students were given magazine articles and asked to make a PowerPoint presentation from the article, to present to the rest of the class.
- Just to go through the article in class and discuss with students.
- Students given an article to read *before* the lesson, to be discussed during the next lesson ('Flipped' learning model – increasingly popular in the UK).
- One teacher pasted articles or bits of articles on her classroom door to highlight 'history in the news', stress the topicality of history and links to the present (e.g. discovery of the body of Richard III, Holocaust Remembrance Day, History of the Olympics, '50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of....' (as the interviewer remarked, 'History not as a school subject or examination but as a way of life.')

***History teachers' ideas about how magazines might be used, and how the EHISTO project might help them to make better/more use of them to develop critical-media literacy*** (prompted by looking at the draft analysis framework, and in some cases, scribbling comments on the draft analysis framework)

- Really important that the learning objects don't end up being just comprehension exercises which just test students' understanding of what they have read. The activities must problematize the topics and make the students think about reliability, 'position', provenance etc.
- Give pupils some time to look through a magazine as a whole, and ask them to rate which bits are a) most interesting, and b) most useful, giving a mark out of 10 and justifying their marks
- (For older/more able pupils): Get them to focus on the editorial and the letters page and ask them to use 'inferential judgement' to 'position' the editorial and individual letters. It was suggested that using magazines could be useful in moving pupils on from the idea of 'bias' to 'position'.
- Precis exercises on magazine articles, focusing on issues of authority and credibility ('In not more than 200 words/6 ppt slides...')
- Get students to write a review of an article, using contextual knowledge (referring to work of other historians).
- Get students to 'act' as professional historians invited on to 'The News' to critique a contentious/revisionist magazine article for 'ordinary viewers'.
- Ask pupils to make links to the present after reading an article (as with the 'History and policy' feature in BBC history magazine (see also *History and Policy* website). (The introduction of 'significance' as a key concept in history teaching in the UK has been really helpful in getting students – and teachers – to think about why a historical person or topic is worth studying -why are we bothering to learn about this? Why does it matter today?)
- Get students to write an analysis of the pictures used in the article – in most magazines there is only a very minimal (often just one line) amount of text explaining what the picture is. Get the students to think/discuss why this particular picture has been chosen. Are they just to make the magazine look attractive or do they serve a purpose? Are there 'hidden agendas' in the choice of pictures (Schumann research)
- Get the students using the web based 'add-ons' that many magazines now have: links to the magazine's website, magazine podcasts (BBC History Magazine particularly good for these), and above all the blogs, where students can add comments and opinions about articles – makes it more interactive.
- 'One of the things with most potential is getting them to make comparisons with other magazine articles, or with other sources outside magazines, and in particular, differences from text book information.

- Get them to think about and talk about the comparative authority and trustworthiness of magazine articles compared to other sources for history – newspapers, films, television, text books etc.
- Find examples, and reference, particularly good magazine articles, ones that are just really good articles, and ones which make particularly useful points about critical media literacy, or the Council of Europe objectives for history. (and perhaps not just for the two topics chosen for particular focus – obviously, can't give attention in depth to lots of topics, but two respondents made the point that there might be some lost opportunities if the project confined itself completely to two topics. It was felt by two interviewees that one of the most useful things the project could offer teachers was to develop a 'bank' of particularly good magazine articles, even if it was just at the level of providing a reference for them. (Main 'complaint' of teachers emerged as the very time consuming nature of finding the best/most useful articles given that many magazines do not provide an index or searchable database (*History Today* is an exception in this respect if people sign up to 'full access', which costs £70 p.a.).
- Use history magazines (and perhaps other sources - newspaper articles?) to develop students' understanding of what a 'polemic' is, and to be able to delineate between 'polemical' and 'balanced' writing. They could be asked to judge the degree to which articles or special issues acknowledged the existence of a range of views about historical issues/personalities. To what extent are other views on the issue acknowledged in an article?
- Get students to assess the extent to which a magazine has academic credibility (composition of editorial board, credentials and affiliation of contributors, are sources/references provided in articles?)
- Important to get student and student teacher feedback on the use of magazines: do they enjoy working with magazines or do they find them boring/hard work? Do they lure them into exploring history more outside the classroom or do they put students off.
- Get students to highlight 'loaded language' in history magazines.
- How do magazines get people to buy their magazine (analysis/deconstruction of front covers, choice of controversial or 'present day' topics)? Who is 'the audience' for the magazine (n.b. web statistics for 'social class' of readers). Why target A/B social class readers?
- Using whole magazine issues, get students to think about/discuss the ways in which history magazines differ from history in schools.
- Get students to make a tally of male to female contributors to history magazines – is history mainly written by men? Is being a historian to some extent 'a male thing'?
- It was interesting to note different views about the accuracy and authority of history magazines; feedback from the UK suggested that teachers regarded history magazines as fairly trustworthy compared to many other sources of information about the past, whereas feedback from Spain suggested a need for care in working with history magazines 'because information in these journals is never as precise as it might be', and 'there are some questions to be discussed with regard to historical accuracy and academic value.'
- A potentially useful function of history magazines was to make the point about the different approach and focus which they bring to the study of the past 'which is radically different from history study at school.'

### ***A few comments on the draft analytical framework***

A lot of the suggestions were felt to be very helpful and provided good ideas for exploration. Perhaps unsurprisingly, the bulk of the teachers' comments related to use with school students rather than student teachers, but a couple of points were made in this respect. For example, it was thought that even student teachers would find some of the terminology used quite difficult, and perhaps needed a bit more explanation (e.g. 'focalisation', 'history mediation', 'means of visualisation'). Two other minor caveats or reservations, it was felt that the exploration of 'fonts' offered limited opportunities for development, and 'Is there name dropping?' was felt to need a bit more clarification.

### **3.3. Summary of history curricula in partner countries in relation to the aims and focus of the EHISTO project (Deliverable 2.1)**

**Description:** Partners were asked to report back on the extent to which the two topics chosen for the focus of the project (Causes and Outbreak of World War One, and Voyages of Discovery-Colonialism-Empire), and to which extent critical media literacy and the recommendations of the Council of Europe for history teaching are explicitly built into curriculum specifications under current arrangements.

#### **Summary and key points arising out of partner responses to the above questions:**

The curricular synopses revealed several major points of divergence in the official arrangements for the teaching of history in high schools across the project partners involved, but perhaps the most reassuring point to emerge was that in terms of the choices which were made at the Augsburg kick-off meeting, the two topics which were selected for focus and development proved to be unproblematic in terms of being taught in schools, sometimes at more than one age level, as well as being featured in popular history magazines.

In terms of the relevance of these arrangements and differences for the execution of the project, several points are worth noting:

In terms of the dissemination of resources and materials arising out of the project, across the countries involved, and across the EU more generally, it appears that Spain and Germany have federal structures for education, with separate regions having autonomy in curriculum arrangements. Sweden, Poland and England have national systems for education, and curriculum stipulations that apply nationwide. This picture is complicated by a recent development in the UK, where although there is still a 'National Curriculum' for history (and other subjects), new types of school – Academies (which now account for more than half of high schools in England) and Free Schools, have autonomy over curriculum matters, and are not required to teach the National Curriculum. However, recent surveys by the Historical Association suggest that in spite of this autonomy, and the latitude currently afforded to all schools in terms of which particular historical topics they choose to focus on, in practice there is still a considerable degree of conformity in terms of which topics are taught to students.

Under both current and proposed versions of the National Curriculum for history in England, the causes and outbreak of World War One are and will be taught in just about every high school – it would be highly unusual if any high school of whatever type did not teach this topic. The situation with regard to the second chosen topic (Voyages of Discovery/Colonialism/Empire) is more complicated. Whereas

some years ago, most English schools taught about Columbus, De Gama and Magellan and the opening up of 'The New World', the very strong emphasis on British history in more recent years has meant that the Voyages of Discovery, Columbus etc, are less widely taught than in the past, and colonialism and empire tend to focus more specifically on British explorers, and the development of the British Empire. The British Empire is a major topic in both the current and proposed versions of the National Curriculum. Popular history magazines also give considerable attention to controversies of interpretation about the British Empire. There is also no shortage of magazine articles about the causes and outbreak of World War One, and this is likely to continue to be the case, given the approaching centenary of the outbreak of this war. As in some of the other countries, this topic could be taught to pupils at more than one age level.

In terms of alignment with Council of Europe recommendations, and the aims of the EHISTO project, there is a considerable degree of alignment with the stated aims of the current National Curriculum for history in England, with its strong emphasis on the development of disciplinary understanding alongside the development of students' substantive historical knowledge and understanding. The emphasis on 'key concepts', such as interpretation, significance, cause, change and diversity, lends itself to the development of materials and activities which contribute to the development of critical literacy, and even in the proposals for the new National Curriculum for history, which place a much stronger emphasis on the development of students' substantive knowledge of British history, there are still clauses which relate to 'understand historical concepts such as continuity and change, cause and consequence, similarity, difference and significance', 'discern how and why contrasting arguments and interpretations of the past have been constructed', and 'gaining historical perspective by placing their growing knowledge into different contexts, understanding the connections between local, regional, national and international history.'

The current citizenship curriculum also stipulates that history should contribute to students' critical and political literacy, and prepare students to live in a tolerant and diverse society, so there is, as things stand, a clear warrant for history teachers to prepare and use learning object based on the aims of the EHISTO project.

However, in terms of links to the present, and to students' everyday lives, unlike the situation in Spain, Sweden and Bavaria, the Secretary of State has urged that there should be a move away from trying to make the history curriculum 'relevant', and wants schools (as in the Netherlands) to place more emphasis on the classical canon of major events in the nation's political and constitutional history. It is interesting to note that in the proposals for the new curriculum, history 'stops' with the election of Margaret Thatcher in 1979, and the Fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989. A recent survey by the Historical Association shows that this goes against the feelings of the majority of history teachers in the UK.

In terms of the range of resources to be used in the teaching of history, teachers are urged to use a wide range of teaching approaches, including museums, field trips and the use of new technology: popular history magazines are not mentioned explicitly, but there is nothing to stop or discourage their use, and it is unlikely that their use in the project would occasion any problems or complaints.

Compared to England and Sweden in particular, the Polish curriculum placed more explicit emphasis on detailing the substantive historical content to be covered in the history curriculum, with less emphasis (at least explicitly) on the development of disciplinary understanding and second order concepts. Although the specifications presented in the summary of the core curriculum did not explicitly link to the Council of Europe recommendations on the teaching of history as clearly as in some other cases, this did not seem to present a problem in terms of teachers exploring and developing materials and developing teaching approaches based on the EHISTO and Council of Europe aims. There was also less direct reference to

linking the past to the present than in some of the specifications in some of the other countries. Although there was no explicit mention of the use of media and popular representations of the past as being a necessary element in teaching approaches, neither did there appear to be anything to discourage or prohibit the use of such resources. In terms of the chosen topics, these seemed to form part of both the junior high school and secondary school curricula, and to be featured in both secondary schools and vocational secondary schools.

The overview of the Spanish system for history education showed that intercultural aims *were* explicitly mentioned in the curriculum specifications, Article 4 of the ESO level objectives stating that pupils should learn ‘the fundamental aspects regarding culture, Geography and History, both from Spain and the world, to respect the artistic, cultural and linguistic heritage; to know about the diversity of cultures and societies in order to better and critically value them, developing attitudes of respect both by the own and the others’ cultures’. As in the case of Bavaria, there was also explicit reference to students being able to use information coming from ‘the social environment, mass media and ICT.’ As in England, the two chosen topics are taught at lower secondary level and ‘also reviewed at Upper Secondary level.’ In terms of general methodological principles, teachers were allowed to use ‘autonomous approaches’, and there was an acknowledgement that in order to maximise student motivation, ‘it is convenient to explicitly remark the usefulness of the contents to be learned’, and that this could be effected by relating content to students’ ‘environment and everyday life.’ (This is in direct contrast to the proposed National Curriculum for history in England).

In terms of the Bavarian curriculum’s links to EHISTO and Council of Europe objectives, both the topics chosen featured in the lower high school curriculum, between 7<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> grade, although there was some variation in the year in which students would encounter these topics, according to the type of school involved. In terms of what the curriculum had to say about the use of popular media products and other elements of public history, the curriculum synopsis suggested that given the inclusion of ‘historical culture’ in curriculum specifications, it was at least implicit that artefacts such as history magazines should be part of history teaching in high schools, ‘moreover the curriculum asks to cover multimedia objects and aims at linking history to the pupil’s lifeworld (extracurricular involvements with history).’ Moreover, in the history curriculum for the Hauptschule/Mittelschule, there was a stipulation that ‘pupils shall learn to deal with press products.’ Another element of the curriculum which accorded with Council of Europe principles for the teaching of history was the requirement that students should develop a knowledge about ‘how “history” is created and what we understand as working methods of academic history.’ Another avenue for the use of history magazines was the requirement for interdisciplinary teaching, which might make possible the use of history magazines in language teaching. (This is an element which might be explored further in the EHISTO project, as this might also be a possible approach in other countries).

Like the National Curriculum for England, much of the Swedish history syllabi focused on the development of disciplinary understanding, rather than confining itself primarily to a list of content to be covered. In this respect there was clear convergence with many of the Council of Europe’s objectives for the teaching of history, and on the importance of developing students’ ability to analyse and assess information critically, ‘Understanding how history is manmade and needs to be critically examined to be of use (and not misuse), ‘Knowledge of time periods, processes of change, events and persons on the basis of different interpretations and perspectives’, and being able to ‘give an account of some historical processes and events that have been used in different ways, and in basic terms explain why they have been used differently.’ There is also (unlike the proposals for the new National Curriculum for history in England), a requirement for students to develop ‘The ability to use a historical frame of reference to understand the present and to provide perspective on the future.’ Although core content is not spelled out in the same detail as in other countries, mention is made of the need to cover ‘colonialism’, and

‘conflicts’, and EHISTO explorations and enquiries before and at the Augsburg kick-off meeting suggested that the choice of topics would not be problematic for Swedish schools, either in terms of what topics were taught in schools, or the availability of appropriate magazine articles on the two topics chosen.

None of the curriculum synopses suggested that official specifications for the teaching of history would pose insurmountable obstacles to the activities envisaged for the EHISTO project, but it is probably helpful for participants to be aware of the differing emphases and nuances of the different systems.

### **3.4. EHISTO Analytical framework for the work on popular history magazines (Deliverable 2.2)**

#### **Introduction**

An exploratory analytical framework for the work on popular history magazines was drafted and discussed at the kick-off seminar at Augsburg in November 2012. The version provided here is an amended version of the framework, in the light of the work involved in the baseline study.

EHISTO aims to establish intercultural and critical media skills within civic education in Europe, using multi-perspective and transnational historical contents. The focus of the project will be on history magazines, in which biased national perspectives are sometimes strongly emphasized. For the comparison of these national perspectives and for an insight into the specific similarities of the medium of “history magazines” in the different EU partner countries, the magazines will be analysed and evaluated.

To make the work as efficient as possible and to achieve comparable results, a common analytical tool has been devised on the basis of questionnaires and interviews with practising teachers in the countries involved in the project, and on a survey of the ideas of project partners. The aim of this analytical framework is to provide a basis for the work which will be done in developing materials which will help to develop the intercultural and critical media skills of European citizens through the use of popular history magazines, in schools, in the training of teachers, and in continuing professional development courses for teachers.

The following list is a loose collection of possible questions and ideas about how history magazines might be analysed.

The sections of the history magazines to be analysed are divided into the following subgroups:

- 1. Overarching Questions, 2. Analysis of the title page 3. Analysis of the table of contents 4. Analysis of the editor’s foreword 5. Analysis of picture spreads at the beginning of a main topic (if there is one) 6. Analysis of the leading article about the topic 7. Self-portrayal of the magazines, 8. Magazine websites**

**Framework**

**1. Overarching Questions**

In what way is the history represented in history magazines different from the one communicated in the schoolbook?	
Is history represented in a multi-perspective way?	
Can different perspectives and approaches to the subject be identified?	
Is it clear enough that history is prone to change and time-bound?	
Do the history magazines provide multiple interpretations for historic events / developments?	
Is history represented in a monocausal or multi-causal way?	
Is the interpretation source-directed?	
Do the history magazines pretend to be academic (academic appearance as a marketing strategy?) If so, in which way are they suggestive of being academic?	
Which measures are taken to attract readers?	
Are historical topics interpreted from a national point of view? Is the “national splendour” of a country a criterion or is history exploited and utilised here in order to raise national pride?	
Linking questions about history magazines to students’ ideas about other sources of information about the past	<p>How reliable/trustworthy/authoritative are history magazines compared to films/television programmes/the internet/Wikipedia?</p> <p>How do you determine the trustworthiness of information?</p> <p>In what ways are history magazines a flawed way of learning about the past?</p>



Are there articles on other topics which might be useful in developing students intercultural and critical-media literacy?	To what extent do history magazines (and particular articles) fulfil the Council of Europe's ideas and criteria for 'good history teaching'?
What 'bits' of history are in magazines but not part of school history?	What proportion of history magazines is given over to aspects of history which are not covered in school textbooks (e.g. History of food, leisure, fashion, culture etc)
How can history magazines be used in a way where students 'make meaning' themselves, rather than just learning what the teacher/the magazine article tell them?	What other views on this person/topic are you aware of that are not given in this article? How do you decide which account/explanation is most accurate? How would you adapt this article for use with younger/less able students? 'In 200 words/5 PowerPoint slides?, summarise the main arguments put forward in the article...'
Is the article (or other historical source of information) polemical or balanced?	
Can you identify ways in which people have tried to distort or misuse history for political or unethical purposes?	
Are some history magazines better than others? In what way?	
What are students views on the use of history magazines in history education?	Do learners find work with history magazines interesting and enjoyable? Do they find them useful? What sort of activities related to history magazines do they find most useful?

## 2. Possible questions regarding the title page

General design/layout of the title page	The same as for the covers of school text books, or different? How do they try to get people to buy the magazine? Who is 'the audience' for the magazine?
What is striking? Are there any eye catchers?	
What kind of visual material is used for the title page? In which way are images used?	e.g. single image or collage, number of images, are the images contemporary, which kind of

	image is used (photo, painting, drawing, printing, graphics ...)
What style of language is used?	e.g. objective, sober and informative, lurid, questioning, revealing, quotes, allusions, inclusion of the reader... 'Popular' or 'Academic' in tone? How does it compare to information about history in newspapers?
Can a specific target group be identified?	e.g. based on the quality of paper or the price?
In comparison to a schoolbook / maybe even the introductory pages for a topic in a schoolbook	Are there different emphases?  Are there differences regarding the design?

### 3. Possible questions regarding the table of contents

How much space is devoted to the cover story?	Number of pages? Is it a 'special issue' focusing on a particular topic or person, or just a mixed collection of articles?
How is the magazine structured? Which sections does it have?	Which sections are of most use or interest (most likely for you to read)? Which sections give us some idea about the 'position' or 'bias' of the magazine?
Are the authors named?	And is there attribution of their credentials (e.g. 'Dr.', 'Professor', 'expert on...' 'author of...', and affiliation (University of....., Honours and awards)?
Which fonts are used? May they have a specific meaning?	
Which style of language is used?	e.g. objective, sober and informative, lurid, questioning, revealing, quotes, allusions, inclusion of the reader...
What kind of visual material is used on the	e.g. single image or collage, number of images,

pages of the table of contents? How are images used? Is there a reference to the cover story?	are the images contemporary, which kind of image is used (photo, painting, drawing, printing, graphics ...)
Can a thematic focus be identified? Does it differ from the focus of the schoolbooks?	What 'sorts' of history are most prevalent? (Political/Wars/National History?) Do articles make links to present issues and concerns? Are some sorts of history 'missing', or left out of history magazines?
Are the topics strongly focused on historic figures (personalisation of history)? Comparison to the schoolbook.	What is the balance between men and women in history; is history portrayed as 'mainly made by men'? Which geographical areas are most commonly focused on - national, European, world history? Are any continents missing or neglected?

#### 4. Possible questions regarding the editor's foreword

How is the reader addressed?	Formal, academic, scholarly? Or consciously trying to avoid this so as not to put some people off?
Which style of language is used?	e.g. objective, sober and informative, lurid, questioning, revealing, quotes, allusions, inclusion of the reader... Are there examples of 'loaded language'?
How is the team of authors presented?	
How important is the academic character of the magazine?	How is the authority of the writers signified? Is there acknowledgement of a 'community of practice' of historians? Why are some high profile 'popular' historians not present (e.g. David Irving)?
How is the choice of the cover story justified? How is the topic narrowed down? Are key aspects (if there are any) justified?	Explosive subject? Relevance to the present?
Can social/political views be identified on the	

basis of the statements in the editor's foreword? If so, which tendencies can be identified?	
Are there any statements about the editor's view of history? If so, which view can be identified?	

**5. Possible questions regarding the picture thread (opening double page)**

What does the image source look like?	
What are the captions to the pictures like?	
What is the image to text ratio?	
Which function does the image have?	Message, aestheticisation, emotionalisation, illustration, source, image distortion (e.g. sepia effect, Serienfunktion des Bildes)

**6. Possible questions regarding the leading article**

What does the layout look like?	Subheadings, columns, info boxes
What style of language is used?	e.g. objective, sober and informative, lurid, questioning, revealing, quotes, allusions, inclusion of the reader, sentence length, sentence structure, jargon, foreign words ...
Is there a narrator? How is the narrator presented?	Zero focalisation, internal focalisation, external focalisation, characters' speech, character's thoughts or quotes?
Is there characters' speech and quoted speech? Does the writer use personalisation?	

Is there name-dropping?	
What is the image to text ratio in the leading article?	
How are images used?	e.g. single image or collage, number of images, are the images contemporary, which kind of image is used (photo, painting, drawing, printing, graphics ...)
Is the article structured in a problem-oriented, questioning way?	Are articles presented as a definitive view of the person or event, or as a contribution to a debate about that person or event?
Are sources and quotes used?  Can different degrees of certainty be identified based on the sources?  Are fictional or uncertain aspects of the representation of history made sufficiently clear and are open questions stated? (Awareness of reality)	
Are several sources compared and different opinions presented / made clear? (multi-perspectivity)	
Are several points of view presented? Is there a change of perspective?	
Are different statements presented (controversy)?	
Are changes discussed? Are developments made clear? (Awareness of historicity)	Are opportunities taken to indicate that views on historical figures, events and problems sometimes change over time. Is the concept of 'revisionism' made explicit?
Are economic interrelationships discussed and dependencies depicted?  (Economical awareness?)	
Are dates mentioned and are there any references to previous or subsequent events? Is there a linear chronological order? (Temporal	

awareness)	
Are there any judgements?	
Which access to the topic is chosen?	Social / political / cultural / individual / economic or military history? Exemplary?
Do the magazines motivate further reading about the topic?	Are there links to other sources at the end of the article (either in other issues of the magazine, or other sources – internet, books etc). Are there references provided for sources that have been mentioned in the article.
Comparison with the schoolbook	e.g. are there contrary statements to the presentation in the schoolbook, different interpretations of history in the history magazine and schoolbook, are individuals portrayed in a differentiated / biased way in both media, is the focus different?

**7. Possible questions regarding the magazine’s self-portrayal**

Is a target group named?	
Do the magazines use means of visualisation?	
Does the magazine claim to work in an academic way? How is the academic approach ensured according to the magazine’s self-portrayal?	
Which aims does the magazine mention regarding the way of history mediation? Which function does the magazine fulfil for the reader in this regard?	e.g. relation to the present life, bringing history to life  e.g. entertainment, acquisition of knowledge, relaxation

## 8. Possible questions about magazine websites

Does the magazine have an associated website?	
What features does the website have?	Index of articles? Podcasts? Blogs where readers can offer feedback comments on articles? What can we learn from feedback comments on articles? Are some topics (including the two topics chosen for focus) 'controversial' in some ways?
How useful are magazine websites?	What use do learners make of magazines' associated websites?